Example mapping of an argument for the PhD study; An example of study of video-mediated second language listening

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| *Inference* | *Warrant supporting the inference* | *Assumptions underlying the warrant* | *Examples of backing sought to support assumptions* | *Stages of argumentation; evidence* |
| Ramification  *How is my work considered in the wider field?* | Research in listening as a multimodal activity contributes to theory development in the field of applied linguistics.  (PhD thesis criteria: The researcher is admitted to the community of scholars.) | Research outputs are broadly disseminated.  Research concerning listening theory is of interest to applied linguists.  Multimodal perspectives of listening are beneficial for foreign language education and language programs.  Study concepts and techniques are transferable for use in other studies. | Applied linguistic journals publish work on listening.  Contemporary research in the field informs multimodal perspectives of language use.  Research on the multimodal listening has utility in applied linguistics research | **Part 4: Appraising the Argument**  *Publication C: Theory contribution*  *Publication B: Assessment focus*  *Publication A: Pedagogical focus* |
| Utilization  *How can the investigation make theoretical and practical contributions?* | The findings of the study contribute to listening theory, and have implications for the teaching and assessment of listening.  (PhD thesis criteria: The research makes an original contribution and has impact.) | Outcomes of the study suggest an agenda for further research.  The results extend current theory and practice in the field.  Examiners and other readers can assess the quality and merits of the study in relation to the standards and practices of the field. | The study meets criteria for quality at a doctoral level.  The study responds to significant challenges in the field. | **Part 3 (B): Presenting the Argument**  *Chapter 6: Theory construction and implications* |
| **Explanation**  *How do I make sense of what I have found?* | The justification of the outcomes resonate with expert opinions and provide additional insights to concepts.  (PhD thesis criteria: The researcher demonstrates critical thinking and independence.) | The findings can be explained through careful reasoning in relation to the conceptual framework. | Close analysis of the data from the appropriate case studies as they relate to key concepts. | **Part 3 (A): Presenting the Argument**  *Chapter 5: Case study 2: Public service advertisements (TAC Victoria)*  *Chapter 4: Case study 1: TED talks (Academic topics)* |

|  |  |  |  |  |
| --- | --- | --- | --- | --- |
| **Evaluation**  *How do I gather sound evidence and conduct a defensible analysis?* | Data can be gathered to investigate multimodal listening.  (PhD thesis criteria: The researcher demonstrates technical competence.) | The gathering and analysis of the data is appropriate, justified and defensible  Analysis of the data is accurate.  The data is gathered in ways that are known, replicable, and sound.  Techniques exist to gather data to research multimodal texts.  The approach of the study lies within the field and the experience of the researcher. | Qualitative measures:  Interviews, verbal report protocols, observations  Statistical measures: Corpus analysis of transcription, surveys, assessment scores | **Part 2: Gathering the data**  *Chapter 3: Method*  Justify and explain the methodology and techniques used to gather data. |
| **Domain definition**  *What scholarship has gone before me, what are current debates, and how are they being investigated?*  *How do I motivate and define the research project?* | Adopting a view of listening as a multimodal activity has implications for theory development, assessment design and pedagogical practices for the field of applied linguistics.  (PhD thesis criteria: The researcher demonstrates authority in the field.) | Potentially, listening can develop through the use of multimodal texts and resources.  All texts are multimodal.  The use of online media, particularly digital video, is widespread as a means of learning.  Contemporary media is online, global and accessible.  Approaches to listening theory, assessment and pedagogy should be relevant and applicable to real world experiences.  Listening is a crucial area to foreign and second language development. | An appropriate methodology and techniques can be adopted for the study.  Research questions can be proposed to focus the investigation.  A conceptual framework can be synthesized.  Contemporary concepts are being debated.  There is a history of studies in the area.  There is a body of literature in the area of listening and media.  The study is motivated by current concerns. | **Part 1: Planning the Argument**  *Chapter 2: Review the history, current debates and methodology concerning the role of multimedia in second language listening.*  *Chapter 1: Motivate and frame the study* |

Resources to guide alignment to the criteria needed for a PhD thesis

Criteria for Part 4: Appraising the Argument

Submission guidelines for authors for conferences, journals, and books

Criteria for Part 3: Presenting the Argument

Questions for Examiners; PhD Handbook

Criteria for Part 2; Gathering the Evidence

Methodology handbooks

Criteria for Part 1; Planning the Argument

Thesis writing handbooks; Literature review handbooks; Contemporary journal articles